

**NOTICE OF MEETING OF THE TOWN OF CAREFREE
PUBLIC SAFETY ADVISORY COMMITTEE**

WHEN: WEDNESDAY, JULY 14, 2021

WHERE: ZOOM ONLINE*

TIME: 1:30 P.M.

Pursuant to A.R.S. § 10-822, notice is hereby given of the time, place and purposes of a meeting of the Public Safety Advisory Committee.

Members of the Committee are participating by technological means or methods pursuant to A.R.S. §10-708.

CALL TO ORDER

ROLL CALL

AGENDA

ITEM #1 Review and approval of the June 16, 2021 meeting minutes.

ITEM #2 Discussion regarding insights and takeaways regarding presentations by each service provider for fire services. Additional discussion regarding service levels, costs, and other recommendations as well as next steps in consideration for drafting a report to the Carefree Town Council.

ITEM #3 Questions, comments and/or requests for future agenda items.

ITEM #4 Adjournment.

DATED this 11th day of June, 2021.

By: Kandace French Contreras
Kandace French Contreras, Town Clerk/Treasurer

Items may be taken out of order

*Due to the risks to public health caused by the possible spread of the COVID-19 virus at public gatherings, it has determined that public meetings will be indefinitely held through technological means. Meetings will be also open to the public through technological means. In reliance on, and compliance with, the March 13, 2020 Opinion issued by Attorney General Mark Brnovich, the Town of Carefree provides this special advance notice of the technological means through which public meetings may be accessed. While this special notice is in effect, public comment at meetings will only be accepted through written submissions, which may or may not be read aloud during meetings.

Join Zoom Meeting:

Click on the following link or cut and paste it into your browser:

<https://us02web.zoom.us/j/3229729660>

A password is not required.

By phone:

Please call 1.669. 900. 6833 or 1.253.215.8782

Meeting ID: 322 972 9660



FOR SPECIAL ACCOMMODATIONS

Please contact the Town Clerk, 8 Sundial Circle (PO Box 740), Carefree, AZ 85377; (480) 488-3686, at least three working days prior to the meeting if you require special accommodations due to a disability.



**MINUTES OF MEETING OF THE TOWN OF CAREFREE
PUBLIC SAFETY ADVISORY COMMITTEE**

WHEN: WEDNESDAY, June 16TH, 2021

WHERE: VIA ZOOM *

TIME: 1:30 P.M.

Members of the Public Safety Advisory Committee participated by technological or methods pursuant to §A.R.S. 38-431(4).

SILENT ROLL CALL

COMMITTEE MEMBERS PRESENT

Chairperson - Leslie Hine

Sheila Amoroso

Peter Burns

Scott Peterson

Kim Taha

Jerry Wetta

Anton Wilke

COMMITTEE MEMBERS ABSENT

Vice Chairperson - Philip Henn

MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PRESENT

Shawn Gilleland, Neil Pavlov, Ryan Travis, Mayor Peterson, Chief Brain Tobin, Dave Hamilton, David Moore, David Maxwell, Dan Jarrett, Eugene Lindsay, John Krajnak, Dave Neilson, Pete Gorraiz, Dave Wilson, Mark Robens, and additional members of the public Brian Moore (Chairman of Daisy Mountain Fire District), Brian Tobin (Daisy Mountain Fire Director), Scottsdale Chief Tom Shannon, Rural Metro Fire Chief John Kratz, Connor Waite (Daisy Mountain Fire Department), Dan Jarrett, Dave, Dave Hamilton, David Maxwell, Delene, John

Krajnak, Jon Binsbacher, Mark Robens, Matthew Woods, Scott Peterson, Steve, Travis Wood and additional members of the public

STAFF MEMBERS PRESENT

Town Administrator, Gary Neiss; Town Clerk, Kandace French-Contreras and Administrative Assistant, Carrie Carter.

Call to Order: Committee Chair Leslie Hine, Town Administer, 8 Sundial Circle, Carefree AZ

Agenda Item One: Approval of the Public Safety Committee Minutes from the May 26th, 2021. Committee Chair Leslie Hines asked the committee to identify any change request. Anton pointed out that page four should say "who did not."

Leslie recommended verbiage which states that Daisy Mountain has not previously contracted fire services with Towns and or entities, whoever with Cave Creek's new proposal Daisy Mountain would consider contracting fire services to Cave Creek and Carefree (if Carefree decides to peruse that route). Additionally Leslie requested to include language that the \$3.9 million was a rough allocation of Scottsdale Fire Department budget, divided by the number of Scottsdale fire stations. If Scottsdale and Carefree decides to partner with one another, the contracted rate may not include all

Kim Taha **Motioned** to approve the June 9th Minutes subject to approved changes. The motion was Second by Anton. The motion was approved unanimously.

Agenda Item Two: Presentation by Rural Metro

Shawn Gilleland is the Public Information Officer for the Rural Metro Fire Department; Brian Davis is the Western State - Fire Chief and lastly Brian Gilbert is the AZ State, Fire Chief.

Shawn explained the history of the Rural Metro Fire Department. This fire department has been serving the Town of Carefree since 1969. Rural Metro has 13 full stations, 196 full time employees and 12 Fire Chiefs. The Carefree Fire Engine has custom features which help service the day to day operations of a rural terrain and desert wildlands.

Mr. Gilleland explained the day to day activities of the Rural Metro Fire Station. These activities include, but are not limited to: emergency medical response, training, maintaining equipment, mountain and river crossings rescue, fire prevention activities, CPR training for the communities, safety surveys, and fire hydrant inspections.

The Rural Metro Fire engine is staffed with 3 personnel and a minimum of one certified Paramedic and 2 fire fighters. It is at the discretion of the Town to determine how many fire personnel should be present during an emergency response. Officer Shawn Gilleland explained he training is the same material, using the same books, same codes as any other fire personnel.

Officer Shawn Gilleland, reviewed Rural Metro statistics. From 2019 to 2020, Rural Metro's average response time was 3 minutes and 12 seconds. Overall between the years 2018-2020 the Town of Carefree had a total of 1173 calls. The majority of these emergency service calls encompassed medical 59% medical services, fire and medical alarms (16%) and snake removals (16%). Brush fires made up 1.2% of calls and commercial fires in 2018-2020

comprised of zero calls. Many of the medical services are made up of personal medical emergency, such as chest pains, drug interactions, surgery recovery, strokes, etc.

Shawn Gilleland answered multiple questions pertaining to emergency response:

What was the number of times a brush truck was needed in response to an emergency call?

The response was the brush truck was utilized in all brush fire emergencies (1.2%).

How would Rural Metro categorize the level of activity at the Carefree Fire Station? Brian Gilbert categorized Carefree as a low to medium fire station.

Committee Chair, Leslie Hines asks how many total response calls out side of Carefree. The Carefree fire engine 821 responds to roughly 25,000-27,000 calls per year.

Peter Burns requested statistically data demonstrating quarterly and monthly fire dispatch service trends with in the last 3 years.

Kim asked is there an impediment in Carefree that makes emergency services difficult to address. Brian Gilbert explained that Carefree has similar obstacles as other communities. One major benefit of Carefree is the tenure of the staff and geographic knowledge of the area.

Shawn Gilleland continued the presentation by explaining Carefree's Mutual Aid Request. In the course of 7 years, the Town of Carefree requested 7 mutual aid calls. Of the 7 calls, 2 were cancelled, prior to the arrival of the mutual aid unit.

Under the current Rural Metro contract with Carefree, Rural Metro maintains the town owned apparatus and equipment. If the fire engine is out of service, Rural Metro supplies Carefree with a replacement fire truck. Captain Travis has effectively saved the Town of Carefree over \$225,000 through grants for fire safety equipment.

With the conclusion of the presentation, Committee Chair Leslie Hine transitioned the meeting into a question and answer forum.

Gary Neiss asked: what happens if Cave Creek decides to enter an agreement with Daisy Mountain and join automatic aid? What happens if the fire house in Cave Creek? What are the financial implications of Carefree supporting a second fire house from Rural Metro? The response from Brian Gilbert was that Rural Metro is committed to keep the fire station in the Town of Cave Creek and will remain in place to serve the unincorporated residents of Cave Creek. Gary asked, what is the possibility of the Rural Metro lease expiring in the Town of Cave Creek? Is there a possibility that Rural Metro relocates if the lease expires? Rural Metro started dialogue with the owner of the Cave Creek fire house to discuss a long term lease or the possibility of Rural Metro potentially purchasing the fire station.

Fire Chief Brian Gilbert explained that the mutual aid process is a standard practice throughout the nation. The Mutual Aid standard is managed by the AZ Fire Chief. Rural Metro is not a member of Automatic Aid because they are a private company.

Jerry Wetta – Asked if the Town of Cave Creek is mentioned in the contract between Rural Metro and Rural Metro. The response from Chief Gilbert was – no. Rural Metro serves areas that do not have access to fire services. Rural metro has determined now to provide fire services to communities on a voluntary subscription basis in all communities (with the exception of Carefree). Generally less than half of the community participates in the voluntarily based subscription process. Low subscription levels results in fewer resources for Rural Metro. Rural Metro will also respond to a call whether or not the caller part takes in the subscription process.

Committee member Scott Peterson, asked what the average subscription cost is for an average home owner? Chief Gilbert responded with \$550.00, and it is based on the square footage of a home.

Shelia Amoroso asked if Rural Metro provided 401k's or pensions to the Rural Metro personnel. The response from Chief Gilbert was 401ks are provided.

Committee Member Jerry Wetta asked, what was the quality of life span of the current fire apparatus? Chief Brian Gilbert explained that the average life expectancy is 10 to 15 years. There is a need to consider replacing Carefree's Fire Truck. The Town Administrator Gary Neiss explained that the Fire Engine is an American La France product. American La France went out of business, making it difficult to find parts for the fire truck. The Town of Carefree will need to replace the fire truck with in one to two years.

Jerry Wetta asked, what is the price range of a new fire truck? Chief Gilbert stated that specs for new units are \$400,000. It will cost an additional \$30,000 to \$40,000 to fully equip a fire truck.

Gary responded to a question, stating that Carefree's specs were based on the unique needs the community which would cost about \$525,000.

Committee Member Scott Peterson asked why was Rural Metro not approved to participate in Automatic Aid? Chief Gilbert is a private practice that has the ability to provide emergency service at a more economic cost. Rural Metro would be interested in participating in Automatic Aid, as a private entity Rural Metro will not be able to participate in the program.

Peter Burns asked if there is a formal measurement to calculate customer satisfaction. Chief Gilbert explained that there isn't a formal measurement, but Rural Metro gauges customer satisfaction based on subscription services.

Peter Burns asked how Rural Metro measures the emergency response time. The 3 minute and 19 second measurement starts when the fire house hears the bell to the time the fire apparatus is on the emergency site.

Peter Burns reviewed the 10 year contract for between Rural Metro and Carefree is \$1.5 million. Peter asked if the same level of service would be offered at the same rate, if Carefree renews the contract. Chief Gilbert explained that Rural Metro has exceptional fire fighters, and should be properly compensated for the services that they provide.

Leslie Hines wrapped up the meeting. Town Administrator Gary Neiss offered to send out a series of questions to the committee members, which will create a foundation for the next meeting.

3:46 Meeting Adjourned

**Background and Discussion Guide
Town of Carefree
Public Safety Advisory Committee
July 14 and July 28, 2021**

This material has been prepared as background and as a discussion guide to assist the members of the Public Safety Advisory Committee (PSAC) in their meetings of July 14 and July 28. There will be additional materials distributed for the July 28 meeting that will delve into the considerations in financing a new master contract for fire protection and emergency services.

This material is divided into the following sections: the charge of the PSAC, the meeting schedule of the Committee, background information gleaned from the presentations to date, considerations for a new master contract and finally, questions to be addressed at both the July 14 and July 28 meetings.

The Committee's Charge

On February 16, 2021 the Town of Carefree's COINS system published the following call for volunteers:

Call for volunteers interested in being appointed to serve on a Town Council Sub-Committee to evaluate how best to provide future Fire and First Responder Service for Carefree Residents

Carefree residents currently enjoy excellent emergency services, fully funded by the Town. The Carefree fire station and associated equipment are owned by the Town, while Rural Metro provides staffing under the Town's master contract.

In recent years, given the growth in the Carefree/North Scottsdale area and evolving cross agency first responder operating approaches and costs, it is time to re-evaluate the delivery of these services to assure that Carefree residents receive the optimum services to fulfill their needs at the most affordable cost. Adding additional urgency to this re-evaluation is that the contract with Rural Metro is set to expire in the summer of 2022.

The Carefree Town Council believes that the most appropriate approach to conduct this re-evaluation is to appoint a Sub-Committee to the Council. This Sub-Committee would study all facets of emergency services, and make recommendations to the Council on how best to proceed. This Sub-Committee will be comprised of interested residents knowledgeable in how government services function and operate, and are analytically oriented.

If you have an interest in serving on the Sub-Committee and meet the established criteria, please send your bio and a statement of interest to: kandace@carefree.org.

The Town Council subsequently selected eight citizens to serve on the Committee and the PSAC held an organizational meeting on April 7, 2021.

Meeting Schedule

At its initial meeting on April 7, the PSAC adopted the following meeting schedule:

- May 12th – Benchmarking Levels of Service (metrics) and finances/budget
 - Automatic Aid v Mutual Aid
 - What Changes are being discussed in the geographic area relative to regional assistance

- Carefree's model for fire service, level of services and associated costs and funding mechanism
- Benchmarking of nearby contracted fire programs and largest adjoining programs
- Carefree budget trends
- Future presentation topics/schedule
- May 26th – Presentation by Cave Creek
- June 9th – Presentations by Scottsdale and Daisy Mountain Fire District
- June 16th – Presentation by Rural Metro

- Break for 4th of July Holiday

- July 14th – Discussion regarding levels of service and recommendations
- July 28th – Discussion regarding levels of service and recommendations

- August 11th – Discussion regarding development of survey regarding policing level of service
- August 25th – Draft Fire report - discussed and refine
- Sept 8th – Financial implications and recommendations
- Sept 22nd – Finalize recommendations/report to be presented to Council October 5th
- Oct. 6th – Review of survey results
- Oct. 20th – Presentation by MCSO
- Nov. 3rd – Presentation by Verra Mobility/Redflex
- Nov. 17th – Discussion regarding level of service and recommendations
- Dec 1st – Draft police report – discuss and refine
- Dec 15th – Finalize recommendations/report to be presented to Council January 4th

The meeting schedule beyond July 28 is tentative and subject to revision.

Background Information Gleaned from the Presentations to Date

The following bullet points were extracted from the four substantive presentations made to the PSAC to date. The lists are not comprehensive but are designed to remind PSAC members of the most pertinent points presented to date. Committee members are free to suggest other points of background information that should be considered in the upcoming discussions.

Carefree

- Rural Metro has served the Carefree area since 1969.
- Prior to 2007, Carefree citizens participated in Rural Metro's fire service through subscriptions.
- In 2007, the Town of Carefree replaced the need for individual subscription service when it executed a five-year master fire contract to provide firefighting services. The contract was renewed in 2012 for a ten-year term. The current contract with Rural Metro is set to expire in July 2022.
- Carefree owns the fire station and the fire engine. The fire engine is nearing the end of its useful life. A new fire engine may cost as much as \$800,000.
- The master fire contract:
 - Calls for Rural Metro to provide staffing for the fire program.
 - The fire engine is staffed by three fire fighters, at least one of which is a paramedic.
 - Is funded through a dedicated municipal sales tax of 1%.

- Over the past 10 FYs, the contract (which includes an escalator clause) has increased from \$1.3 million to \$1.55 million.
 - The dedicated funding stream has experienced an average annual structure deficit/shortfall of over \$400,000.
- Rural Metro currently holds the Certificate of Necessity from the Arizona Department of Health Services for ambulance services in the Carefree area. The ambulance is:
 - Routinely dispatched with the fire engine on all calls
 - Staffed with two individuals, both of which are fire fighters and at least one of which is a paramedic.
 - It is presumed that the ambulance service is only billed when a patient is transported, and that billing is made to the patient or other third parties.
- Rural Metro has characterized the Carefree station to be a low to medium call volume station. The breakdown of calls to the station between July 2018 and June 2020 were reported to be:

There were 1173 total responses

• Medical (includes vehicle accidents)	602	50%
• Fire and medical alarms	188	16%
• Snake removals	188	16%
• Invalid assist	33	2.8%
• Check hazard	27	2.3%
• Brush fires	14	1.2%
• Smoke in the area/structure	9	.78%
• Unknown fire	9	.76%
• Vehicle fires	5	.43%
• Residential fires	3	.25%
• Illegal burn	2	.17%
• Lock-out	2	.17%
• Person trapped	1	.085%
• Commercial fires	0	

- Rural Metro has no formal mechanism to measure customer satisfaction with its services. As a company that operates across the country as a primarily subscription service, it uses subscription renewals as a gauge of customer satisfaction.

Cave Creek

- The Town of Cave Creek is currently served through individual subscription services provided by Rural Metro. Approximately 40% of properties within the Town are subscribers.
- The Town of Cave Creek does not own the fire station or the fire equipment.
- After the recent wildland fires in the area in which multiple jurisdictions that are members of Automatic Aid responded, Phoenix and Daisy Mountain expressed concerns to Cave Creek about the equity of the situation whereby they responded to an area that has not made a commitment to provide fire services. This led the Town of Cave Creek to recently adopt a policy to join Automatic Aid.
- The newly adopted policy has led Cave Creek to investigate options to develop a fire program which includes building a fire station (near their existing Town Hall), acquiring equipment and other assets, and contracting for staffing.
- Since Rural Metro does not qualify for Automatic Aid, the Town considering a master contract with Daisy Mountain Fire District to staff its fire program. It is also considering sharing in the costs with Daisy Mountain for building and staffing an additional fire station on the western boarder of Cave Creek.
- Cave Creek projects the operating costs of a single fire house which participates in Automatic Aid could costs approximately \$2.5MM per year.

New Master Contract Considerations:

- Since Rural Metro is not part of Automatic Aid, Carefree is not a participant in Automatic Aid.
- The current Rural Metro station in Cave Creek has been responding to most (?) calls from Carefree's west side.
- There has been significant interest in the deliberations of the Carefree Public Safety Advisory Committee with regular attendance by representatives from Rural Metro, Daisy Mountain, Scottsdale, and Cave Creek.
 - It is worth noting that neither Daisy Mountain nor Scottsdale have any contracts with communities outside their jurisdictions to provide fire protection.
 - Both Daisy Mountain and Scottsdale participate in Automatic Aid. It is anticipated that if either of these jurisdictions were to contract with Carefree, their existing operating protocols would be used in fulfilling the contract.
 - As participants in Automatic Aid, both jurisdictions would staff the fire engine with four firefighters, two of which would be paramedics.
 - The jurisdictions' participation in Automatic Aid would not transfer automatically to Carefree, the terms of participation in the program would be determined by the Life Safety Council
 - Rural Metro. It appears the company is very interested in renewing the master contract and has indicated it is open to revising its contract with respect to service levels. The company has also indicated that it is likely that the costs of the new contract would be higher than the current contract.
 - Daisy Mountain. Given the current discussions with Cave Creek, the District has indicated it is also interested in exploring a master contract with Carefree. A significant consideration for the District in evaluating a potential contract would be assuring "equity" in services and costs between its existing taxpayers and any new customers it would bring on. It has indicated that the Cave Creek estimate of approximately \$2.5 MM per year is probably a reasonable estimate of costs to staffing a fire station.
 - Scottsdale. The representative from SFD indicated some interest in a contract with Carefree but with decidedly less enthusiasm than the other potential vendors. It is believed the tepid response is tied to the significant challenge the Department is faced with in restaffing, given the extraordinary level of anticipated retirements in its workforce. The Department was created in 2005 and in the next three to seven years 153 of the 280 sworn members may be retiring.
 - It is not likely there will be any impact to the cost of homeowner's insurance in the Carefree area regardless of master contract vendor or being in or out of Automatic Aid.

Questions for the July 14th meeting: in

The following questions have been developed to guide the Committee's discussion on July 14. Committee members are free to suggest other questions that they feel should be addressed.

1. What are the committee members' insights/takeaways and questions from each presentation we heard?
 - a. How has the Cave Creek decision to move to Automatic Aid changed the situation for Carefree?
2. Pros and cons of Automatic Aid versus Mutual Aid for Carefree and where does the committee stand on this question?
 - a. Will auto aid be more expensive? Why?
 - b. What is the difference in service between the two approaches?
 - c. What is the difference in resources between the services should a situation escalate?

- d. What conditions, if any, would the Automatic Aid Life Safety Council impose on Carefree?
 - i. Provider – e.g., DMFD vs. SFD?
 - ii. Equipment – beyond dispatch, e.g., new truck, brush truck?
3. What are the decision points for each committee member and what is the consensus of committee as to the key considerations upon which to base our recommendations?
 - a. Service Levels
 - b. Cost & Financing
 - c. Handling of non-fire services – fire marshal (inspections, plan review, sprinkler review, Cert of Occupancy, etc.)
 - d. Should recommendations include a specific vendor or a process to move forward – that is, should the Town have serious discussions a single vendor or multiple vendors to flush out details of a potential contract?
4. Overview/review of report outline and discussion of issues/points the committee wants to see included.

Questions for the July 28th meeting:

The tentative questions that have been identified for the discussion on July 28 are:

1. What is the financial capacity of the Town to absorb additional costs given the structural deficit of the current funding mechanism?
2. What financial pressures would be placed on the Town given an increased structural deficit?
3. What are the options to offset this increasing structural deficit?
 - a. What is the legal process to move forward with each option to offset the structural deficit?
4. What are the recommendations of this committee and why?

Conclusion

The upcoming discussions will largely form the basis for the compilation of the Committee's recommendation to the Town Council. It is hoped that the material presented in this document will contribute to the Committee's deliberations.